

Reading and Evaluating Position Papers

Advice for Readers

Five Aspects to Consider

The review of position papers
Includes these five aspects:

- The Candidate
- The Candidate's Supervisor
 - The Readers
 - The Papers
- Theoretical Base of CPE

The Candidate

- The Candidate has worked hard to create these position papers.
- They are sitting on “pins and needles” as they await the response from the readers.
- The Candidate’s future is affected by the outcome of this review of the papers.
- It is **ESSENTIAL** the Contact Reader is in timely contact with the Candidate

The Candidate's Supervisor

- The Supervisor has been working with the Candidate and is invested in the outcome.
- The Supervisor wants to know where to support the student in the process of learning theory.
- The Supervisor wants to know if the feedback they have given has been on track.

The Readers

- The readers are volunteers AND busy.
- They have knowledge and experience that informs their assessment of the papers.
- They have a commitment to supervisory quality in CPE.
- They play an important role in the ongoing education of supervisors in ACPE.

Theoretical Base of CPE

- Over the years ACPE has identified three areas of theory that inform supervision:
Theology – Personality – Education
- CPE embraces a process oriented, inductive approach to teaching/learning.
- Respect for uniqueness, diversity, cultural humility, inclusiveness informs supervision

First Things First

- Notify Candidate the Position Papers have been received.
- Notify ACPE that you have received the position papers.
- Contact the other readers to determine a time to discuss the papers.
- Set aside time to review the papers before the agreed upon time to discuss them.

The First Read through

- Read the Composite Report Appendix 10, 2010 Certification Manual.
- Read the papers
- Read the Composite Report again
- Score the individual papers
- Be bold in assessment!

Then What?

- Let the convener know you are prepared to discuss the papers.
- Convener will set up a conference call to discuss the papers.
- With your penciled score sheets in hand, talk to each other!
- After taking notes and listening to each other, consider reading papers one more time.

Next

- Convener will set up another conference call if needed.
- Team discusses scoring until agreement is reached.
- Convener writes draft letter during conference call if possible.
- Readers send comments to convener for inclusion in report.

Finally (or almost)

- Convener writes letter to candidate with results from the reader team's review of the papers.
- If revision is recommended, the convener will make substantive recommendations for inclusions or reorientations or emendations of the papers.
- Invite Candidate to consult with readers.
- Wait for the revised papers to come back!

Excellence

- If you read a theology/spiritual practice paper that is well-organized, articulate, coherent, intelligent and beautiful to read.....
- Recommend it for the Len Cedarleaf award!

Theory Papers

- Readers are looking for:
 - Integration of theories with writer's history
 - Evidence of knowledge
 - Writers should be answering these questions:
 - Do you know the concepts of the theory?
 - Have you used significant primary resources?
 - Are you able to apply concepts to the practice of supervision?

Theory Papers

- Readers are looking for:
 - The theorists/theologians the writers use
 - Whether the writers show evidence of familiarity with relevant literature
 - 1) Are these current theorists? If not, why?
 - 2) Can these theories be applied to CPE Supervision?
 - 3) Are the theories compatible with one another?

Theory Papers

- Readers are looking for:
 - The writer's answers to the questions in the certification manual and the grid
 - The use of both the manual and the grid
 - The articulation the “why” of supervision rather than “how”

Theology/Spiritual Practices Paper

- Focus on the writer's understanding of Transcendence/God and the impact this understanding has on the manner in which the writer will/function as a CPE Supervisor
- The represented concepts of Transcendence/God should be consistent with the writer's religious traditions, their teachings and practices

Theology/Spiritual Practices Paper

- Addresses:
 - The writer's understanding of God/Divine
 - Characteristics of God/Transcendent
 - The impact of these characteristics on the writer's supervision
 - The writer's understanding of persons as creatures of God/Divine
 - The writer's awareness of the impact of cultural background has on the understanding of God/Transcendent

Theology/Spiritual Practices Paper

- Addresses:
 - The writer's' understanding of suffering, sin, illness
 - How humankind relates to the Divine/Transcendent
 - The impact this concept of the Divine/God on human relationships
 - The theologians that speak to the writer's understanding of God/Divine?
 - How does the writer make use of these theologians?
 - Key concepts and understanding of these concepts

Theology/Spiritual Practices Paper

- Readers may ask if writer is able to
 - Represent the theologians accurately
 - When using a concept, is there an example of its use in supervision?
 - Write so that the concepts flow together? Are the concepts congruent with one another?
 - Articulate the “why” of supervision, not the “how” of supervision (2/3 – 1/3 or 3/4 – 1/4 rule)
 - Demonstrate “critical purchase” of their theologians’ writings

Personality Theory

- Readers are looking for:
- The focus of this paper is on the writer's understanding of how the personality is formed and how one grows and develops
- How the writer's understanding of personality informs supervisory assessment, goals, strategies and interventions?

Personality Theory

- Readers are looking for
 - Who are the theorists that inform the writer's understanding of personality?
 - The writer's understanding of the theorist and a deep working knowledge of the theory
 - The writer's:
 - understanding of human nature
 - how personality develops
 - concepts and terms from the theory
 - theorist presented accurately

Personality Theory

- Readers are looking for
 - Do the central themes resonate. Does this paper flow and do the concepts build upon each other
 - Does the writer use various sources, primary and secondary sources
 - Does the writer make use of relevant literature
 - What is the writer's critical purchase of this theory
 - What works and doesn't work
 - What does one do when the theory breaks down

Personality Theory

- Readers are looking for
 - How does one make use of this theory to make assessments of the student's readiness for learning
 - How does this theory inform the goals for the student
 - How does this theory inform the supervisor's interventions and supervisory alliance

Personality Theory

- Readers are looking for
 - Is this theory congruent with the writer's spiritual perspectives/theology paper?
 - Is this theory congruent with the writer's educational theory?
 - How does the writer's cultural background influence his/her understanding of personality theory and development

Personality Theory

- Readers are looking for
 - The “whys” of the theory not the “how's” of supervision ($2/3 - 1/3$ or $3/4 - 1/4$ rule)
 - When the writer uses a key concept, is it followed with an example of supervisory practice
 - The paper to flow, not be spliced together
 - Whether the writer has mastery of the materials

Educational Theory

Readers are looking for:

- If the focus of this paper is on how people learn – individually, dialogically and in groups
- Whether the writer's understanding of the clinical method of learning relates to his/her theory of education
- How does the writer's and the students' cultures influence the educational process?

Educational Theory

- The Readers are looking for:
 - What educational theory guides the writer in his/her understanding of how one learns
 - What are the key concepts of this theory? Does the writer have a good working knowledge of this theory?
 - How does this theory assist the writer in making assessments and interventions with the students?
 - How does this theory assist the writer in the evaluation of students?

Educational Theory

- The Readers are looking for
 - The writer's understanding of how an individual learns
 - The writer's understanding of how an individual learns in the group setting
 - How the educational theory assists the supervisor to form a supervisory alliance with the student?
 - How the writer's theory makes use of the various components of the CPE process?
Orientation, verbatim seminar, IPR, evaluation process

Educational Theory

- The Readers are looking for
 - Understanding of group theory – learning within a group setting
 - Critical purchase of the theory
 - That the theory is coherent with personality theory and theology
 - A good working knowledge of the theory

Educational Theory

- Readers are looking for
 - Definition of key concepts
 - Examples from supervisory practice
 - Awareness of the writer's cultural influences, and integration of theory with the writer's personhood, as well as awareness of the cultural differences between supervisor and students

Theory Papers

- Readers
 - Are looking for integration of theory/principle, self and practice.
 - Know these papers are not research papers
 - Understand that these are papers which should reflect the supervisor's understanding of God/Transcendent, personality and learning.

Thank you

- Thank you for your willingness to be a reader
- Thank you for your contribution to excellence in clinical pastoral education
- Thank you for your collaborative work as a team
- Thank you for being timely in your response to the writers
- Thank you, thank you, thank you!